

Strategy: Compare and Contrast

DESCRIPTION

There are several ways in which to apply this method including comparing and contrasting content pictures in picture books, text language in similar phrases throughout a book, pictures in books to real-life, and comparing sentences in different languages. Whether you are comparing and contrasting words or pictures, comparing is always about finding similarities and contrasting is always about finding differences. A key to using this strategy is to consistently use the same language across lessons when comparing and contrasting so the students can get familiar with the question and the format for the answer. This helps students become familiar with the questions and statements and allows them to start using the phrasing when they speak.

An example of using the same phrase includes: "What is in this picture?" (#1) This picture has *a cat.* Then on the next page, you want to follow the same format ("What is in this picture?" (#2) This picture has *a duck*). Then you would compare and contrast the pictures by asking "what is the same?" and "what is different?"

STEPS

Content in Picture Books

- 1) Compare content pictures by using the same language for each page.
"What is in this picture?"
Answer: "A cup/a bottle is in this picture."
- 2) Ask "What is the same?"
"This picture (#1) has a man. That picture (#2) has a man. They are the same."
- 3) Ask "What is different?"
"This picture has a cup. That picture has a bottle. They are different."

Text Language

- 1) Find similarities in the phrases that you are comparing.
"from a FOUNTAIN;" "in a BOTTLE"
- 2) Write two of these phrases on the board.
- 3) Have students compare the similarities and the differences, using similar sentence structure and stems.

Comparing and Contrasting Pictures to Other Pictures in the Book or Real Life

- 1) Take photographs of items in the book that are in the child's life and compare them to those in the book.
- 2) This is the same object. In the book it is a drawing/photograph/painting.

Compare and Contrast Languages in Bilingual Books

- 1) Make lists of nouns and verbs that represent the same meaning in each language.
- 2) Show students words in each language in the book that match the meaning in the other language,
- 3) Using the bilingual book "Eating" as an example, use the following verbs and nouns:
What is she eating? She is eating potatoes.
Who is carrying the baby? She is carrying the baby.
- 4) REVERSE: She is eating rice. What is she eating?

BOOKS

Blackstone, S. (2003). *Where's The Cat?* Barefoot Books

- Elementary grades. ELL Stage: beginner
- Has sentence stems on each page beginning with a preposition and has rhyming pairs (eg on the chair, up the stair, under the bed, behind the shed)
- Includes repetition of the same question for chanting/memorization
- Limited amount of new text on page
- Can compare to one's own environment using the same phrasing in the book

Carle, E. (1987) *Have you seen my cat?* Simon Spotlight.

- Elementary grades. ELL Stage: beginner
- Repetitive title question

Davis, K. (2002). *Who hoots?* Wagon Books.

- Early elementary. ELL Stage: beginner

Davis, K. (2001). *Who Hops?* HMH Books for Young Readers.

- Elementary grades. ELL Stage: beginner. 320L

Fox, M. (2019) *Whoever You Are*. Clarion Books.

- All grades. ELL Stage: intermediate beginner. AD490L
- Compare and Contrast in different languages (Spanish)

Fox, M., & Horacek, J. (2004). *Where is the green sheep? Donde Esta La Oveja Verde?* Clarion Books.

- Early elementary grades. ELL Stage: intermediate beginner. AD380
- Repetition of the title question
- Bilingual book. There is also a Chinese edition.

Giganti, P., & Crews, D. (1988). *How many snails?: A counting book* (1st ed.). Greenwillow.

- Early elementary grades. ELL Stage: intermediate beginner

Giganti, P., & Crews, D. (2005). *How many blue birds flew away?: A counting book with difference* (1st ed.). Greenwillow.

- Elementary grades. ELL Stage: advanced beginner

Jenkins, S., & Page, R. (2008). *What do you do with a tail like this?* Clarion Books.

- Early elementary grades. ELL Stage: beginner and multilevel. 510L

Kerley, B. (2006). *A Cool Drink of Water*. National Geographic Kids.

- Youth and young adult. ELL Stage: multi-level.
- Contains a poem and a photo glossary
- All nouns are capitalized in the book
- All prepositions are in italics

Stewart, M. (2017). *Can an aardvark Bark?* Beach Lane Books.

- Elementary grades. ELL Stage: beginner/intermediate beginner. 720L
- Compare and contrast animals to the sounds they make

Walsh, M. (2002). *Do donkeys dance?* Lawrence, KS: Mammoth/Egmont.

- Early elementary grades. ELL Stage: intermediate beginner

LESSON PLAN

ANCHOR BOOK

Fox, M. (2019) *Whoever You Are*. Clarion Books. AD490L

OBJECTIVE

- Students will be able to find similarities and differences between the sentences in the English version of the book and in the Spanish version of the book.

PREPARATION

- Make vocabulary cards that name each of the nouns for things people do. One side in Spanish, one side in English (i.e., smiles, hugs, etc)

PRESENTATION

- Picture Walk: Focus attention to the illustrations of the text
- Teach the NOUNS of each language with the pictures
- Distribute vocabulary cards to individual students.
- Have children chant the repeated sentence, holding up the card when the noun is spoken

GUIDED PRACTICE

Message: Words are different in Spanish and in English: (Smiles, Cry, laugh, hurts, hearts, skin, schools, pain, love, joy, words) but the feeling is the same.

1. Students come up, one by one, and pick a noun card.
2. Write on the board:
“ _____ is the same as _____ ” “ _____ is different from _____ ”
“ _____ sounds different from _____ ” “ _____ sounds similar to _____ ”
3. Students take turns coming up and choosing a noun from the book to insert into the blank space.
4. Students will practice re-reading parts of the text that compare and contrast.
5. With bilingual books/In bilingual settings, students take turns coming up and saying one of the words in English and another student comes up and says it in their native language (Spanish, Chinese, etc.)
6. Students take turns making a gesture for one of the words and the teacher calls on another student to make the same gesture. For example, if the student makes a gesture for a heart, students choose another word that may use the same gesture (the gesture for heart and love are the same, the gesture for pain and hurt is the same).
7. Students take turns making a gesture for one of the words and the teacher calls on another student to make an opposing gesture. For example, if the student makes a gesture for a heart, students choose another word that may use an opposing gesture (the gesture for smile and cry are different/opposites, the gesture for a smile and hurts are different).
8. Make a semantic Word Map grouping all similar words together. (Sad Feelings: Pain, cry, hurts, etc.; Happy Feelings: smiles, laughs, joy, love; Places: land, school, house, etc.)

ASSESSMENT

1. Have students say a sentence that compares two words and then a sentence that contrasts two words.
“ _____ is the same as _____ ” “ _____ is different from _____ ”
“ _____ sounds different from _____ ” “ _____ sounds similar to _____ ”